

PHIL 360 – Buddhist Philosophy

Meeting Times:

Location:

Instructor: Sean M. Smith

Contact: sean.smith@hawaii.edu or 808 956 8954

NOTE: *Except when necessary, e-mails should concern procedural questions about the course only. Philosophical questions will be addressed in class and during office hours.*

Office Hours: TBD or by appointment in Sakamaki Hall, Room B313. Students should not hesitate to make an appointment if they are unable to come to office hours. We *will* find time to meet and discuss any issues.

Course Description:

This course will provide an in-depth survey of Indian Buddhist philosophy. All of the readings will be from primary source material ranging across the entire history of this tradition. You will be given the opportunity to consult secondary literature as well, but the focus will be on the primary texts so as to immerse you in the lifeworld of Indian Buddhist philosophical thought. We begin with a general overview of the Indian philosophical milieu in which the Buddha taught. This contextualization is necessary to understand the kinds of questions and problems that the Buddha and his philosophical forebears were responding to. We then move on to a thorough exploration of the core conceptual foundations of Buddhism embodied in the Pali *tipitika*, the canon of the Theravāda Buddhist school. This will be followed by a survey of the major Buddhist philosophical schools from the Sanskrit tradition. These came to dominate the Indian sub-continent as Buddhism spread within and beyond India. These include various permutations of the Abhidharma schools, Madhyamaka thought, Yogācāra idealism, as well as the Buddhist Epistemologists. These sources are ancient and profound. They have the potential to be life changing if they are studied with diligence and care. Thus, you should be prepared to work seriously if you choose to take this course.

Notes:

1. This course has a Contemporary Ethical Issues (E) focus designation. Contemporary ethical issues are fully integrated into the main course material and will constitute at least 30% of the content. At least 8 hours of class time will be spent discussing ethical issues. Through the use of lectures, discussions and assignments, students will develop basic competency in recognizing and analyzing ethical issues; responsibly deliberating on ethical issues; and making ethically determined judgments.
2. This course also has a Writing Intensive (W) focus designation. This means that you'll produce at least 16 pages of writing. You will receive substantial feedback on your first assignment as well as produce a proposal for the term paper that will be carefully graded to make sure that before you even start writing your final assignment, that your framing for that project is in good working order. Additionally, it will be essential that students come to office hours to discuss their work with the Professor before submitting it for grading. This will make it possible for students to make certain that their work is progressing well.

Texts: The following books can be purchased from the UH bookstore.

Required Texts:

- i. *Early Buddhist Discourses* by John J. Holder [EBD]
- ii. *Nāgārjuna's Middle Way* (eds.) by Mark Siderits and Shoryu Katsura [NMW]
- iii. *The Bodhicaryāvatāra of Śāntideva* [BC]
- iv. *Buddhist Philosophy: Essential Readings* (eds.) by William Edelglass and Jay L. Garfield [BP]
- v. Hacker, D. and Sommers, N. (2011) *A Pocket Style Manual*, 6th Edition. Bedford.
- vi. Strunk, W. and White, E.B. (1999) *The Elements of Style*, 4th edition. Pearson.

Recommended Text: Buddhism as Philosophy by Mark Siderits [BaP]

All other readings will be available online as pdfs on Laulima.

Course Requirements:

1. Short Paper (5-7 pp)	30% of course grade	Due:
2. Long Paper Proposal (2-3 pp)	10% of course grade	Due:
3. Long Paper (11-12 pp)	50% of course grade	Due:
4. Class Participation	10% of course grade	N/A

How to Read: The readings for this class are difficult. Read slowly. Figure out how many hours per day you're able to devote to this class and how many days you have to do a given reading. Do the math and do at least the minimum amount of reading every day to get everything done before class. If you can, re-read where necessary after you've attended lecture.

Handouts: For each class, there will be a handout that I will make available at the start of class or if necessary, I will upload it to the course webpage either the day before or morning of a lecture. These handouts will be very detailed. Make sure you have a copy of the relevant handout for each lecture.

Paper Submission Guidelines: See below for late penalty and extension policies.

- Submit all papers to me in class.
- Do *not* include a title page. Title pages are evil.
- In the top right-hand corner of the first page include the following information single-spaced:

Your Name
Student Number
Course Code
Due Date
Word Count

- Make sure you title your papers in a way that reflects the content of what you've written.
- Double space your work and use a 12-pt. font.

- Include page numbers in the footer of your pages. Look at this document and mimic it. Be sure to include your name as well.

Writing Assignment 1: Short Paper – 5-7 pp (30%):

Instructions: This assignment is designed to get you to engage critically with an argument. The task is straightforward, but not so simple. First, explain the argument you’ve chosen to engage with as best you can. Then try to come up with an objection to the argument. Consider a possible response and try and think of a response to that response.

Possible Topics:

1. In the Discourse on the Not-Self Characteristic, the Buddha offers two arguments as to why the five aggregates are not to be regarded as a self. In your own words, explain what a self might be such that the Buddha might be interested in rejecting the existence of such an entity. Explain what the five aggregates are and why one might be prone to think that some or all of these aggregates are a self. Lastly, as clearly as you can, explain *one* of the Buddha’s arguments for why the five aggregates are not self. State an objection to the argument as you’ve interpreted and try and think of how the Buddha or someone who endorses his position might respond to this objection.
2. In the first verse of chapter 18, An Analysis of the Self, of the *Mūlamadhyamakakārikā*, Nāgārjuna claims that: “If the self were the *skandhas*, it would participate in coming to be and passing away. If it were something other than the *skandhas*, it would be something having the defining characteristic of a non-*skandha*.” Read the rest of the chapter very carefully. Then, in your own words, explain the argument of this chapter. How does this argument relate to other approaches to the Not-Self idea we have encountered in class thus far (for example, the Discourse on the Not-Self Characteristic and Vasubandhu’s arguments against the existence of *ātman*s and *puṅgalas*)? Try to formulate an objection to Nāgārjuna’s argument and explain how it challenges Nāgārjuna’s position. How might Nāgārjuna or someone sympathetic to his approach respond to your objection? Can you think of a rejoinder?
3. A topic of your choosing. Consult with me first to get approval.

Long Paper Proposal – 2- pp (10%)

Instructions: The purpose of this assignment is to force you to think about your final paper well in advance of its due date. This assignment will have three parts. The first part should be an introduction to your final paper written in prose form. See instructions below in ‘Writing Assignment 2: Long Paper’ for precise instructions on how to write an introduction. The second part of this assignment will be a point form breakdown of how the long paper will go. Divide the paper into sections (e.g Intro, Setting Up the Problem, Arguing for your Thesis, Considering Objections, Conclusion) and give a few point form notes for each section. The third part of the paper will be a bibliography. Consult the relevant secondary literature from the syllabus and branch out from there as required. There is no minimum or maximum for how many sources you sight.

Writing Assignment 2: Long Paper – 10-12 pp (50%):

Instructions: This final assignment is a proper philosophy essay. You will need to develop a thesis statement that provides the reader with a positive sense of what you will accomplish in the essay and how you will argue for your view. A good thesis statement will take a critical stand on an existing philosophical issue and inform your reader about what you plan to argue.

Your introductory paragraph should do three things. First, it should give the reader a general sense of what the paper is about. Second, you should state your thesis clearly. It can be as simple as something like: “In this paper, I will argue that x” where ‘x’ = your thesis statement. Finally, you should briefly explain how you will argue for your thesis by giving the reader an outline of how the paper will be structured.

You will need to make sure you do three things in the paper. First, explain the dialectical situation you are going to engage with; provide the reader with enough exegetical information to be able to understand the philosophical stakes. Second, explain why your view, your thesis is correct. Third, consider an objection against your view and try to come up with a response.

Topics:

1. In verse 43 of the sixth chapter on the Perfection of Forbearance in the *Bodhicaryāvatāra*, Śāntideva makes some intriguing claims about grasping: “His the knife, and mine the body — the twofold cause of suffering. He has grasped the knife, I my body. At which is there anger?” (*BC*, p. 54). In verses 44-49, he develops an argument that supports this claim. Explain that argument in your own words. What is the strongest objection you can think of to this argument? How would Śāntideva reply to this objection? Is his argument salvageable? Why or why not?
2. The Yogācāra school develops the idea of a storehouse-consciousness. What is the purpose of this development? What philosophical work is it doing? Is the view susceptible to criticism that it sneaks in the notion of a ‘self’ into Buddhist philosophy? Why or why not?
3. A topic of your choosing. Consult with me before writing.

Important: For the final paper, specify in the top right-hand corner of the first-page, along with your other information, whether you want comments or not. If you do not specify that you want comments, you will not receive any comments on your final paper.

Readings and Schedule: Everyone is expected to do the assigned readings prior to class. Readings are assigned on a weekly basis. Come to class prepared with at least one question about the readings. The question can be as straightforward as a clarification about what an obscure passage is saying or a worked out objection to an argument you find in the text. The point is to find a way for you to get more comfortable talking about what you’re reading. This will help you become a better reader, thinker, and writer.

Week 1: - *Introduction and the Context of Indian Philosophy*

A primer on arguments (pdf), Ch. 1 of *Presuppositions of India’s Philosophies* by Karl H. Potter (pdf) and *BaP* Ch. 1

Week 2: - *The Life of the Buddha and the General Shape of his Teaching*

Discourse on the Noble Quest (MN 26) (*EBD* Ch. 1) and the *Dhammapada* (pdf - read all of it)
Recommended: *Philosophy of the Buddha* by Christopher Gowans, Ch. 2 (pdf)

Week 3: - *The Basics of Buddhist Philosophy I – Suffering and its Causes*

Note: No class on Monday September 3 because of the Labor Day holiday.

The Discourse on the Setting in Motion the Wheel of the Dhamma (SN 56.11) (pdf), The Fire Discourse (SN 35.28) (pdf), The Poem of Kissā Gotami and its Commentary (Thig X, 213-23) (pdf) The Discourse on Great Causes (DN 15) (*EBD* Ch. 3) and The Discourse on Supporting Conditions (SN 12.23) (pdf)

Recommended: *BaP* Ch. 2

Week 4: -*The Basics of Buddhist Philosophy II –The Buddha’s Method of Not-Self*

Discourse to the Kālāmas (AN 3.65) (*EBD* Ch. 2), the Discourse on the Parable of the Water Snake (MN 22) (*EBD* Ch. 9), the Discourse to Vacchagotta on Fire (MN 72) (*EBD* Ch. 10), The Discourse on the Not-Self Characteristic (SN 22.59) (pdf), Is there a Self? (SN 44.10) (pdf), and Vajirā Sutta (SN 5.10) (pdf)

Recommended: *BaP* Ch. 3 and *Philosophy of the Buddha* by Christopher Gowans, Ch. 6

Week 5: - *Meditation and the Limits of Cognition*

The Discourse on the All-Embracing Net of Views (DN 1) (pdf), The Greater Discourse to Mālunkkyāputta (MN 64) (pdf), The Shorter Series of Questions and Answers (MN 44) (pdf), The Greater Discourse on the Establishing of Mindfulness (DN 22) (*EBD* Ch. 4) and The Discourse on the Mindfulness of Breathing (MN 118) (pdf)

Recommended: “On Some Definitions of Mindfulness” by Rupert Gethin and *Satipaṭṭhāna: The Direct Path to Realization* by Anālayo Bhikkhu Chs. II and III

Week 6: – *Abhidharma I: Dharma Theory*

Prologue of the *Abhidhammattha-Sangaha* of Acariya Annurudha with commentary by Sumangala (pdf) and Buddhaghosa’s *Visuddhimagga* Ch. XIV (pdf)

Recommended: Karunadasa, Y. (1996) “The Dhamma Theory: Philosophical Cornerstone of the Abhidhamma” (pdf)

Week 7: – *Abhidharma II: Some Different Schools*

Excerpts from Chapter 1 of Vasubandhu’s *Abhidharmakośa* (pdf), Karunadasa, Y. (2010) *The Theravada Abhidhamma: Its Inquiry into Conditioned Reality*, Ch. 10 (pdf), and Vasubandhu’s Critique of the Soul *BP* Ch. 26

Recommended: Noa Ronkin “Abhidharma” <http://plato.stanford.edu/entries/abhidharma/>
SHORT PAPER DUE IN CLASS ON MONDAY OCT. 1ST IN CLASS

Week 8: - *Abhidharma* III: Abhidharma vs. Pudgalavāda

Pudgalavāda Doctrines of Persons *BP* Ch. 24 and Vasubandhu’s *Abhidharmakośa*: Critique of the Pudgalavādin’s Theory of Persons *BP* Ch. 25

Recommended: *BaP* Ch. 6 and Amber D. Carpenter “Persons Keeping their Karma Together”

Week 9: - *Madhyamaka* I – Nāgārjuna

Nāgārjuna’s Middle Way [NMW] Introduction and Dedicatory Verse, Chs. 1. Analysis of Conditions and 15. An Analysis of Intrinsic Nature

Recommended: *BAP* Ch. 7, Jan Westerhoff “Nāgārjuna,” <https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/nagarjuna/> and Ch. 2 of *Nāgārjuna’s Madhyamaka: A Philosophical Introduction* by Jan Westerhoff

Week 10: - *Madhyamaka* II – Nāgārjuna continued...

Nāgārjuna’s Middle Way [NMW] Chs. 18. An Analysis of the Self and 22. An Analysis of the Tathāgata, 24. Analysis of the Four Noble Truths, and 25. An Analysis of Nirvāna

Recommended: Ch. 4 of *Indian Buddhist Philosophy* by Amber Carpenter and Sonam Thakchoe, “The Theory of Two Truths in India,” <https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/twotruths-india/>

Week 11: - *Madhyamaka* III – Śāntideva’s *Bodhicaryāvatāra*

Śāntideva’s *Bodhicaryāvatāra* [BC] – Read the whole thing

Recommended: Ch. 9 of *Engaging Buddhism: Why It Matters to Philosophy* by Jay L. Garfield (pdf) and *BaP* Ch. 9

LONG PAPER PROPOSAL DUE IN CLASS ON MONDAY OCT. 29TH

Week 12: - *Yogācāra* I - Asaṅga and Vasubandhu

Asaṅga’s *Summary of the Great Vehicle*, Introduction and Ch. 1 (pdf) and Vasubandhu’s *Twenty Verses* and their commentary (pdf)

Recommended: *BaP* Ch. 8 and Ch. 7 of *Indian Buddhist Philosophy* by Amber Carpenter

Week 13: - *Yogācāra* II – More Vasubandhu and Candrakīrti’s Critique

Vasubandhu’s *Treatise on the Three Natures*: A Translation and Commentary (pdf) and

Candrakīrti's *Madhyamakāvatārahāsyā* 6.86-97 BP Ch. 27

Recommended: Jonathan C. Gold, "Vasubandhu," <http://plato.stanford.edu/entries/vasubandhu/>

Week 14: - *Buddhist Epistemology and Logic I: Perception and Inference*

Dignāga's *Pramāṇasamuccaya*: Chapter 1, Section 1 'On Perception' (pdf) and Ch. 4 of *Philosophy in Classical India* by Jonardon Ganeri (pdf)

Recommended: Birgit Kellner (2010) 'Self-awareness (*svasaṃvedana*) in Dinnāga's *Pramāṇasamuccaya*', *Journal of Indian Philosophy* Vol. 38: 203-231 (pdf)

Week 15: - *Epistemology and Logic II: Apha*

Excerpts from Dharmakīrti's *Pramāṇavarttika* (pdf)

Recommended: John D. Dunne "Key Features of Dharmakīrti's Apha Theory" (pdf)

Week 16: - Śāntarakṣita's *Grand Synthesis*

Śāntarakṣita's *Ornament of the Middle Way* (pdf), see BP Ch. 4 for a commentary on verses 1-63

FINAL ESSAY DUE ON

COURSE POLICIES (Read Carefully):

A. Late Assignments: Assignments will be reduced 1/3 a letter grade for each day that they are late, including weekends. Extensions may be granted if there is need. Students should contact their TA to request extensions before the due date and be prepared to provide any necessary medical documentation.

B. Contact Policy: The Professor and TA's will be available to answer questions at weekly office hours and by appointment. The course website will be used to post announcements and readings; students are expected to check it, and their university email accounts, regularly. Students may email the Professor or TA's with any procedural questions. Keep in-depth philosophical questions for class and office hours.

C. Accessibility: If you require accommodations or have any accessibility concerns, feel free to contact KOKUA at any time. Their address is: <https://www.hawaii.edu/kokua/>

The course instructor is happy to provide any accommodations needed to ensure that all materials and activities are accessible to all students. It is the responsibility of students, however, to communicate their needs to the instructor and accessibility services so that accommodations can be organised in a timely and efficient manner.

D. Academic Integrity: Don't plagiarise. Academic integrity is essential to the pursuit of learning and scholarship in a university, and to ensuring that a degree from the University of Hawai'i is a strong signal of each student's individual academic achievement. The University treats cases of cheating and

plagiarism very seriously.

Plagiarism includes, but is not limited to, submitting, to satisfy an academic requirement, any document that has been copied in whole or in part from another individual's work without identifying that individual; neglecting to identify as a quotation a documented idea that has not been assimilated into the student's language and style; paraphrasing a passage so closely that the reader is misled as to the source; submitting the same written or oral material in more than one course without obtaining authorization from the instructors involved. Another common, though often unreported consequence of representing someone's ideas as your own, is spontaneous combustion, something to be avoided at all costs. The University's Code of Behaviour on plagiarism and academic honesty can be found here:

<https://www.hawaii.edu/eli/useful-information-for-students/academic-honesty/>

E. Health Services: University Health Services Mānoa (UHSM) is staffed by physicians, nurse clinicians, nurses, and other support staff, and offers a wide range of medical services and programs to UH Mānoa students, with many of the services also available to UH Mānoa faculty and staff and students from other UH campuses. Services include general medical care on a walk-in basis; women's health, sports medicine, psychiatry, and dermatology clinics by appointment; pharmacy and clinical laboratory; and student training, employment and volunteer opportunities.

1710 East West Road Honolulu, Hawaii 96822 Honolulu, HI 96822

(808) 956- 8965

www.hawaii.edu/shs/

F. Mental Health: Academic work is difficult and psychologically demanding. It's important to work hard and push yourself to do your best, but it is even more important to take care of and be kind to yourself. The instructor is available to discuss such matters if there is need. The University also has a number of resources available. Please do not hesitate to make use of these if difficulties arise:

<https://manoa.hawaii.edu/campus-life/health/>

<http://manoa.hawaii.edu/counseling/>

G. Title IX: The University of Hawaii is committed to providing a learning, working and living environment that promotes personal integrity, civility, and mutual respect and is free of all forms of sex discrimination and gender-based violence, including sexual assault, sexual harassment, gender-based harassment, domestic violence, dating violence, and stalking. If you or someone you know is experiencing any of these, the University has staff and resources on your campus to support and assist you. Staff can also direct you to resources that are in the community. Here are some of your options:

If you wish to remain **ANONYMOUS**, speak with someone **CONFIDENTIALLY**, or would like to receive information and support in a **CONFIDENTIAL** setting, contact the confidential resources available here:

<http://www.manoa.hawaii.edu/titleix/resources.html#confidential>

If you wish to **REPORT** an incident of sex discrimination or gender-based violence including sexual assault, sexual harassment, gender-based harassment, domestic violence, dating violence or stalking as well as receive information and support, contact:

Contact: Dee Uwono
Director and Title IX Coordinator Hawai'i Hall 124
2500 Campus Road
Honolulu, HI 96822
(808) 956-2299
t9uhm@hawaii.edu

Important Note: As a member of the University faculty, I am **required to immediately report** any incident of sex discrimination or gender-based violence to the campus Title IX Coordinator. Although the Title IX Coordinator and I cannot guarantee confidentiality, you will still have options about how your case will be handled. My goal is to make sure you are aware of the range of options available to you and have access to the resources and support you need. For more information regarding sex discrimination and gender-based violence, the University's Title IX resources and the University's Policy, Interim EP 1.204, go to:

<http://www.manoa.hawaii.edu/titleix/>

H. Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender (LGBT) Student Services: UH Mānoa strives to maintain a safe and inclusive campus environment that is free from harassment and discrimination. The office provides direct services to students of the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa to confidentially discuss or seek advocacy and support for mistreatment due to their actual or perceived sex, gender identity, gender expression, or sexual orientation.

Contact: Camaron Miyamoto
Queen Lili'uokalani Center for Student Services 211 2600 Campus Road
Honolulu, HI 96822
(808) 956-9250
email: lgbtq@hawaii.edu
<http://manoa.hawaii.edu/lgbt/>

I. Office of Gender Equity: This office offers direct services to victims and survivors of sexual harassment and sexual assaults. Brief descriptions of services offered are available here.

Contact: Jenna Friedman
Queen Lili'uokalani Center for Student Services 210 2600 Campus Road
Honolulu, HI 96822
(808) 956-9499
email: geneq@hawaii.edu
www.manoa.hawaii.edu/genderequity

J. Prevention, Awareness, and Understanding (PAU) Violence Program: This program exists to inspire, educate, and empower students and campus communities to build safe living-learning environments, end interpersonal violence, and encourage holistic well-being in ways that are supportive, collaborative, student-centered, and strengths-based. PAU Violence Program staff provides direct services to all University of Hawai'i at Mānoa students including crisis response, safety planning, academic support, and referrals to campus and community resources.

Contacts: Jennifer Barnett and Leslie Cabingabang
Queen Lili'uokalani Center for Student Services 211 2600 Campus Road
Honolulu, HI 96822
(808) 956-8059
uhmpau@hawaii.edu

K. Student Parents At Mānoa (SPAM): This group seeks to increase the visibility of and resources for student parents at UH Mānoa as they pursue education while parenting. SPAM staff provide advocacy, support, and referrals for pregnant and parenting students to help them succeed in their educational goals.

Contact: Teresa Bill
2600 Campus Road
Queen Lili'uokalani Center for Student Services 211 Honolulu, HI 96822
(808) 956-8059
gotkids@hawaii.edu
<http://manoa.hawaii.edu/studentparents/>